New York State School Boards Association

SUPERINTENDENT EVALUATION

Copyright 2015 by the New York State School Boards Association

SUPERINTENDENT EVALUATION

The New York State School Boards Association (NYSSBA) recognizes that boards of education have a legal obligation to evaluate superintendents annually. More importantly, NYSSBA realizes that it is one of the most important responsibilities of the school board. An effective performance evaluation helps drive school improvement and student achievement, develops a positive relationship between the school board and superintendent, demonstrates accomplishments of the district and sets annual priorities. The superintendent evaluation process is not a means to an end, but rather an ongoing and dynamic process. Decisions regarding both process and instrument should reflect a cooperative effort between the school board and superintendent.

Copyright 2015 by the New York State School Boards Association

SUPERINTENDENT EVALUATION

This evaluation model offers a three-part guide for evaluating the superintendent:

Part I is based on standards and professional practices derived partly from the American Association of School Administrators and other sample evaluations. Each standard will be reviewed and rated.

Part II is based on local priorities of the district defined in annual superintendent objectives. Collectively, the superintendent and board define three to five objectives that focus the superintendent's efforts for the year. An assessment will be made with regard to the successful completion of these annual objectives.

Part III is the final performance summary sheet. It provides a final rating on the superintendent's performance standards, annual objectives, summative comments, recommendations and signatures. The final summary sheet is placed in the superintendent's personnel file.

HOW TO USE THIS EVALUATION MODEL

The whole board should participate in the process from start to finish, and the board president or assigned board designee is responsible for expediting the evaluation process.

1. Begin with a pre-assessment meeting between the superintendent and board to review the instrument and process. The board and superintendent should agree on the evaluation timeline, instrument and process. Collectively, the board and superintendent review the standards of performance as well as identify the annual superintendent objectives based on local priorities of the district.
2. Determine if the evaluation process will occur only once, at the end of the school year as a summative (final) evaluation, or will also include a mid-year formative evaluation. If no mid-year formative evaluation is done, a scheduled progress report may be warranted.
3. It is recommended that the superintendent provide his/her own self-assessment with evidence to the board. Board members should consider the superintendent's self-assessment and supportive evidence when completing their own instruments.
4. The board president or designee collects all individual board member instruments and compiles the results and comments.
5. An executive session, with board members only, is convened to discuss the evaluation results and provide a decision regarding performance ratings, and a final comprehensive comment summary and recommendations.
6. Shortly thereafter, the board meets again in executive session with the superintendent to review and discuss the evaluation results, make any changes or adjustments to the final evaluation, discuss recommendations for improvement, and begin to define the upcoming year's priority objectives.

Note: The superintendent's contract often contains provisions with regard to the evaluation of his/her performance. Before adopting an evaluation process, it is critical to reference the superintendent's contract to make certain they are consistent with one another.

Copyright 2015 by the New York State School Boards Association

PERFORMANCE STANDARDS AND RATING SCALES

The five (5) standards of the superintendent's job:

1. **Vision, Culture & Instructional Leadership** – The superintendent leads the district by promoting the success of all students, articulating a vision of learning, developing a positive school climate and demonstrating best practices in instructional programs and staff professional development.
2. **Operations, Resource & Personnel Management** – The superintendent demonstrates the knowledge, skills and ability to effectively manage operations that promote a safe and effective environment for students and staff, ensures the fiscal health of the district, and implements sound personnel practices.
3. **Board Governance & Policy** – The superintendent works effectively with the board of education, exhibits a shared understanding of board and superintendent roles, leads and manages the district consistently with the board's policies, and demonstrates the skills to work effectively with the board.
4. **Communication & Community Relations** – The superintendent establishes effective communication with students, parents, staff and community, and has the knowledge and awareness of different cultures among all community members to effectively engage and respond to diverse interests and needs to support the success of all students.
5. **Ethical Leadership** – The superintendent promotes the success of every student and every staff member by acting with integrity, fairness and in an ethical manner.

Performance ratings will use the HEDI scale which is familiar to most New York schools.

Rating Scale – Highly Effective, Effective, Developing, Ineffective (HEDI)			
Highly Effective	**Effective**	**Developing**	**Ineffective**
Performance has continually exceeded the criteria	**Performance consistently meets the criteria**	**Performance is inconsistent and partially meets the criteria**	**Performance does not meet the criteria and requires significant improvement**
Noteworthy evidence and data demonstrates the superintendent's performance has had an exceedingly positive impact on students, staff, community relations and/or program outcomes. The board should cite specific data or evidence that supports this rating.	Noteworthy evidence and data demonstrates the superintendent's performance maintains effective results and good relations with students, staff, community members and satisfactory program outcomes. The board should cite specific data or evidence that supports this rating.	Noteworthy evidence and data demonstrates the superintendent partially met the criteria and desired results. Performance has made some gains toward relations with students, staff, and community members and has moderately impacted program results. The board should cite specific data or evidence that supports this rating.	Noteworthy evidence and data demonstrates the superintendent's performance has not met the criteria or desired results. Performance has not made any gains in program results or toward relations with students, staff, and community members. The board should cite specific data or evidence that supports this rating.

Copyright 2015 by the New York State School Boards Association

RECOMMENDED GUIDELINES

How do board members conduct the evaluation fairly and objectively?

It is the responsibility of the school board to evaluate the performance of the superintendent. No process or instrument is completely objective. There will always be some subjectivity, but every evaluation process should foster a fair analysis of the superintendent's performance.

Consider these things when conducting the superintendent's evaluation:

- Give the review the time it deserves
- Maintain a respectful, professional process
- Focus on standards and outcomes (not personality)
- Ask the superintendent to conduct a self-assessment
- Use multiple evidence-based documents when assessing performance
- Identify strengths in performance to build upon
- Address poor results with tact and constructive criticism
- Give recommendations for corrective action where needed
- Go beyond conclusion reporting, consider a problem-solving focus
- Encourage a professional development plan
- Conclude the evaluation by outlining priority objectives for the coming year

Copyright 2015 by the New York State School Boards Association

THE TIMELINE: THE SUPERINTENDENT EVALUATION IS AN ONGOING PROCESS WITH A REPEATING CYCLE

SUGGESTED TIMELINE FOR SUPERINTENDENT EVALUATION	
SUGGESTED TIMELINE	**ACTION**
Summer	1. The board develops or confirms the vision, mission, annual goals and core values of the district.
Summer/Early Fall	2. The board and superintendent collectively define the superintendent's annual priority objectives in measurable targets to be completed in 12 months based on district goals/long-range plans. 3. The superintendent's professional development plan is reviewed with the board to support his/her goals for the coming year.
Fall	4. The board and superintendent review the superintendent's contract, job description, agree upon the evaluation process (including a request for a superintendent self-evaluation), instrument, rating method and possible supporting documents/information/data to be used to measure performance. 5. The board files the procedures by September 10th according to Commissioner's regulations, 8 NYCRR §100.2 (o)(2)(v). 6. The board president and superintendent review the evaluation process and instrument with new board members.
Quarterly or Early Winter	7. The superintendent makes interim progress reports to the board on district goals and superintendent annual objectives, and/or the board conducts an informal mid-year formative performance assessment.
Spring	8. The superintendent conducts a self-assessment and gathers supporting evidence and provides it to board members. (Certain data may not be available at the time of the evaluation, therefore, the prior year's data may be used.) 9. Individual board members complete the evaluation instrument considering the superintendent's self-evaluation and submit their completed instrument to the board president or designee to be compiled, according to district's procedures. 10. Shortly thereafter, board members meet in executive session to discuss their evaluation of the superintendent and determine the board's official evaluation rating and commentary. 11. The board's official evaluation document(s) is/are shared, clarified and discussed with the superintendent in executive session. Changes to the evaluation may be made as a result of the discussions. Professional development objectives will be included as a part of the final evaluation comment(s). 12. A copy of the evaluation final performance summary sheet is placed in the superintendent's personnel file.
Summer	13. Repeat cycle.

Note: New superintendents not hired at the beginning of the school year may need a different review cycle. See the superintendent's contract for reference.

Copyright 2015 by the New York State School Boards Association

PART I

RATING THE SUPERINTENDENT ON PERFORMANCE STANDARDS

Instructions for rating the performance standards

Individual board members may rate the superintendent's professional practice as shown in the example below. Board members may place an "X" in the box that best describes the superintendent's performance in that professional practice area and then determine the overall rating for the standard area based on the HEDI rating scale. Consider the importance of the professional practice if an overall performance rating is not clearly evident.

USE AN "X" TO MARK THE RATING OF EACH AREA

STANDARD 5: ETHICAL LEADERSHIP

The superintendent promotes the success of every student and every staff member by acting with integrity, fairness and in an ethical manner.

Professional Practice	Highly Effective	Effective	Developing	Ineffective
	Continually exceeds the criteria	Consistently meets the criteria	Partially meets the criteria	Does not meet the criteria
5.1 Demonstrates ethical and professional behavior, inspiring others to higher levels of performance	X			
5.2 Maintains a caring and professional relationship with staff, grounded in shared district values		X		
5.3 Demonstrates appreciation for, and sensitivity to, the diversity of the school community, and respects divergent opinions			X	
5.4 Demonstrates efforts to close the achievement gap across all demographics		X		
5.5 Demonstrates a high level of self-awareness and improves upon professional practice		X		
Rating				

Possible Data Sources & Documents:

- ☐ Parent, community, and staff survey data
- ☐ Teacher, school executive, and staff retention data
- ☐ Ability to confront conflict and build consensus
- ☐ Shared decision making
- ☐ Outreach efforts
- ☐ School board policies
- ☐ Minutes and reports
- ☐ Office of Civil Rights data on discipline
- ☐ Superintendent's performance goals

Additional sources:

- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____

Rating for this standard

HE	E	D	I
☐	☒	☐	☐

Comments: (Identify strengths or recommendations for improvement)

Copyright 2015 by the New York State School Boards Association

Copyright 2015 by the New York State School Boards Association

STANDARD 1: VISION, CULTURE & INSTRUCTIONAL LEADERSHIP

The superintendent leads the district by promoting the success of all students, articulating a vision of learning, developing a positive school climate and demonstrating best practices in instructional programs and staff professional development.

Professional Practice	Highly Effective	Effective	Developing	Ineffective
	Continually exceeds the criteria	**Consistently meets the criteria**	**Partially meets the criteria**	**Does not meet the criteria**
1.1 Leadership actions, staffing and resources are clearly aligned to a student achievement focused vision, and that vision is evident in the school culture				
1.2 Demonstrates a deep understanding of quality instruction and consistently promotes effective instructional programs and high expectations for student learning outcomes				
1.3 District goals are systemically aligned throughout the district with a focused plan for student achievement and school improvement supported by resources				
1.4 Leads and supports the use of data informed instruction for administrators and teachers				
1.5 Monitors and reviews the effectiveness of curriculum and instruction and their alignment with state standards				
1.6 Ensures that all staff have district-specific professional development that directly enhances their performance and improves student learning				
1.7 Sets self-improvement goals and applies learning from professional development				
Rating				

Possible Data Sources & Documents:

- ☐ District strategic plan
- ☐ School improvement plan
- ☐ Professional development plans based on data (e.g., student performance, teacher working conditions survey)
- ☐ Leadership team agenda
- ☐ Student performance goals
- ☐ Student performance data
- ☐ Use of formative assessment to impact instruction
- ☐ Number of principal and teacher improvement plans (PIP, TIP)
- ☐ Graduation rates, % of students going to college

Additional sources:

- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____

Rating for this standard

HE	E	D	I
☐	☐	☐	☐

Comments: (Identify strengths or recommendations for improvement)

Copyright 2015 by the New York State School Boards Association

STANDARD 2: OPERATIONS, RESOURCE & PERSONNEL MANAGEMENT

The superintendent demonstrates the knowledge, skills and ability to effectively manage operations that promote a safe and effective environment for students and staff, ensure the fiscal health of the district, and implement sound personnel practices.

Professional Practice	Highly Effective	Effective	Developing	Ineffective
	Continually exceeds the criteria	**Consistently meets the criteria**	**Partially meets the criteria**	**Does not meet the criteria**
2.1 Develops and ensures the implementation of procedures and structures to support compliance with local, state and federal laws and regulations				
2.2 Implements personnel procedures, recruitment and employee performance programs to hire and retain the best qualified teachers, administrators and personnel				
2.3 Aligns and adjusts resources accordingly to meet district priorities and annual goals/objectives operating within budget and fiscal guidelines				
2.4 Guides the process of fiscal planning and budget development and makes recommendations based upon the district's current fiscal position and future needs				
2.5 Stays informed of facilities use and needs and makes facilities recommendations as needed to the board, promotes safety across the district, and ensures a facilities management plan is in place for future needs				
2.6 Effectively works with district bargaining units and actively seeks to improve bargaining outcomes that best serve students and the district				

Possible Data Sources & Documents:

- ☐ District strategic plan
- ☐ Number of teachers with National Board Certification and graduate/advanced level licensure
- ☐ Teacher; school executive; and staff diversity
- ☐ Recruitment and retention data
- ☐ Assessment of professional development on the impact of student learning
- ☐ Technology plan
- ☐ 3-5 year financial plan
- ☐ External audit
- ☐ 3-5 year capital plan
- ☐ End of year budget status report
- ☐ Staff attendance rates and turnover
- ☐ VADIR data
- ☐ Construction projects timelines and budgets
- ☐ District leadership development and succession plan

Additional sources:

- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____

Rating for this standard

Rating	HE	E	D	I
	☐	☐	☐	☐

Comments: (Identify strengths or recommendations for improvement)

Copyright 2015 by the New York State School Boards Association

STANDARD 3: BOARD GOVERNANCE & POLICY

The superintendent works effectively with the board of education, exhibits a shared understanding of board and superintendent roles, leads and manages the district consistent with board policies, and demonstrates the skills to work effectively with the board.

Professional Practice	Highly Effective	Effective	Developing	Ineffective
	Continually exceeds the criteria	**Consistently meets the criteria**	**Partially meets the criteria**	**Does not meet the criteria**
3.1 Offers professional advice to the board with appropriate recommendations based on thorough study and analysis				
3.2 Keeps the board regularly informed with data, reports and information which enables them to make effective timely decisions				
3.3 Interprets and executes the intent of board policies, and advises the board on the need for new and/or revised policies				
3.4 Works collaboratively with the board to shape district vision, mission, and goals with measurable objectives of high expectations for student achievement				
3.5 Makes considerable effort to have a positive working relationship with the board, treating all board members fairly and respectfully, and attempts to resolve any serious conflicts with board members				
Rating				

Possible Data Sources & Documents:

- ☐ Timeliness of board packets
- ☐ District strategic plan
- ☐ School improvement plans
- ☐ Board meeting agendas
- ☐ External reviews and audits (e.g., budget, child nutrition, transportation)
- ☐ Copies of district procedures and publications (e.g., student handbooks, discipline policies, safety procedures)
- ☐ Correspondence

Additional sources:

- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____

Rating for this standard

HE	E	D	I
☐	☐	☐	☐

Comments: (Identify strengths or recommendations for improvement)

Copyright 2015 by the New York State School Boards Association

STANDARD 4: COMMUNICATION & COMMUNITY RELATIONS

The superintendent establishes effective communication with students, parents, staff and community, and has the knowledge and awareness of different cultures among all community members to effectively engage and respond to diverse interests and needs that support the success of all students.

Professional Practice	Highly Effective	Effective	Developing	Ineffective
	Continually exceeds the criteria	**Consistently meets the criteria**	**Partially meets the criteria**	**Does not meet the criteria**
4.1 Communicates key information to all stakeholders in an appropriate and timely manner				
4.2 Works collaboratively with staff and community members to secure resources and effective partnerships to support district goals and student success				
4.3 Uses effective public information strategies to communicate and promote a positive image of the district with families, community, the media, state and local officials				
4.4 Establishes effective communication within the district and promotes positive interpersonal relations among staff				
4.5 Creates an atmosphere of trust and respect with staff, families and community members				
4.6 Regularly attends events and visibly engages the school community and the community at large				

Possible Data Sources & Documents:

- ☐ Survey results from parents and other community leaders
- ☐ Policy and procedure documents for internal communications
- ☐ Visible support for district goals and priorities from community leaders, such as educational foundation activities, civic club scholarships, etc.
- ☐ Partnership agreements and other documents to support collaborative efforts to achieve school district goals and priorities
- ☐ Accounts of school and district accomplishments in various forms of public media
- ☐ District website
- ☐ Newsletters and other public engagement documents designed to strengthen connections to the community
- ☐ Membership and participation with community organizations (e.g., PTA)
- ☐ Community college/university partnerships, collaborative projects, and professional development initiatives
- ☐ Attendance at community/school events

Additional sources:

- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____

Rating for this standard			
HE	**E**	**D**	**I**
☐	☐	☐	☐

Rating

Comments: (Identify strengths or recommendations for improvement)

Copyright 2015 by the New York State School Boards Association

STANDARD 5: ETHICAL LEADERSHIP

The superintendent promotes the success of every student and every staff member by acting with integrity, fairness and in an ethical manner.

Professional Practice	Highly Effective	Effective	Developing	Ineffective
	Continually exceeds the criteria	**Consistently meets the criteria**	**Partially meets the criteria**	**Does not meet the criteria**
5.1 Demonstrates ethical and professional behavior, inspiring others to higher levels of performance				
5.2 Maintains a caring and professional relationship with staff, grounded in shared district values				
5.3 Demonstrates appreciation for, and sensitivity to, the diversity of the school community, and respects divergent opinions				
5.4 Demonstrates efforts to close the achievement gap across all demographics				
5.5 Demonstrates a high level of self-awareness and improves upon professional practice				
Rating				

Possible Data Sources & Documents:

- ☐ Parent, community, and staff survey data
- ☐ Teacher, school executive, and staff retention data
- ☐ Ability to confront conflict and build consensus
- ☐ Shared decision making
- ☐ Outreach efforts
- ☐ School board policies
- ☐ Minutes and reports
- ☐ Office of Civil Rights data on discipline
- ☐ Superintendent's performance goals

Additional sources:

- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____
- ☐ _____

Rating for this standard

HE	E	D	I
☐	☐	☐	☐

Comments: (Identify strengths or recommendations for improvement)

Copyright 2015 by the New York State School Boards Association

PART II

SUPERINTENDENT ANNUAL OBJECTIVES

Instructions for Rating the Superintendent on Annual Objectives

Indicate progress made related to each stated objective. Include multiple sources of data as supporting evidence for the progress and/or attainment of each objective. If data sources are unknown prior to the executive session with the superintendent, wait until supporting evidence is available to complete this section.

For the board members' convenience, the district clerk can prepopulate the chart on the following page with the superintendent's annual objectives.

THE SMART MODEL

Identifying annual objectives with the superintendent should define student achievement objectives, priorities and issues unique to the district. Three to five key objectives that follow the SMART model (specific, measurable, achievable, relevant and time-bound). Optimally, the objectives should be aligned with the district's goals and within the scope of the superintendent's control. Benchmarks showing progress at certain intervals throughout the year should be reported and applied to each objective.

Specific	• Define expectations • Avoid generalities and use verbs to start the sentence
Measurable	• Quality, quantity, timeliness and cost
Achievable	• Challenging, but attainable goals
Relevant	• Link the goal to higher level district goals.
Time-bound	• Set timelines to complete the goal with benchmarks to indicate progress

Note: While it is recommended that annual objectives be developed each year, it is understood that in some instances they may not be developed.

Copyright 2015 by the New York State School Boards Association

ANNUAL SUPERINTENDENT OBJECTIVES

Objectives and evidence of progress need to be identified before completing this sheet.

ANNUAL SUPERINTENDENT OBJECTIVES (Up to 5)	EVIDENCE OF PROGRESS OR COMPLETION (3-5 Evidence/Data Sources)	Highly Effective	Effective	Developing	Ineffective
		Exceeded Objective	Met Objective	Partially Met Objective	Didn't Meet Objective
1.					
2.					
3.					

Copyright 2015 by the New York State School Boards Association

ANNUAL SUPERINTENDENT OBJECTIVES

Objectives and evidence of progress need to be identified before completing this sheet.

ANNUAL SUPERINTENDENT OBJECTIVES (Up to 5)	EVIDENCE OF PROGRESS OR COMPLETION (3-5 Evidence/Data Sources)	Highly Effective	Effective	Developing	Ineffective
		Exceeded Objective	Met Objective	Partially Met Objective	Didn't Meet Objective
4.					
5.					
Comments					

Copyright 2015 by the New York State School Boards Association

SUPERINTENDENT EVALUATION SUMMARY SHEET

For Part I and Part II

Summary Rating Instructions:	PART I - Standards:	HE	E	D	I
To be completed by the individual board member. Place the performance rating for each corresponding standard in the grid to the right.	1. Vision, Culture & Instructional Leadership (pg. 8)				
	2. Operations, Resource & Personnel Management (pg. 9)				
	3. Board Governance & Policy (pg. 10)				
	4. Communication & Community Relations (pg. 11)				
	5. Ethical Leadership (pg. 12)				

Summary Rating Instructions:	PART II - Objectives:	HE	E	D	I
To be completed by the individual board member. Place the performance rating for each objective in the grid to the right.	Annual Objective # 1 (pg. 14)				
	Annual Objective # 2 (pg. 14)				
	Annual Objective # 3 (pg. 14)				
	Annual Objective # 4 (pg. 15)				
	Annual Objective # 5 (pg. 15)				

Summary Comments

Copyright 2015 by the New York State School Boards Association

New York State School Boards Association

PART III
SUPERINTENDENT EVALUATION
FINAL PERFORMANCE SUMMARY SHEET

Superintendent's Name: _____ Academic Year: _____

Evaluators (list all board members):

_____ _____ _____

_____ _____ _____

_____ _____ _____

This summary sheet can be used to indicate the collective rating of the superintendent's performance using the HEDI scale.

Summary Rating Instructions:

The board president will tally each board member's ratings for the five standards and objectives and record the totals in the corresponding boxes.

PART I - Standards:	HE	E	D	I
1. Vision, Culture & Instructional Leadership				
2. Operations, Resource & Personnel Management				
3. Board Governance & Policy				
4. Communication & Community Relations				
5. Ethical Leadership				

PART II - Objectives:	HE	E	D	I
Annual Objective # 1				
Annual Objective # 2				
Annual Objective # 3				
Annual Objective # 4				
Annual Objective # 5				

Note: In general, individual ratings and comments from individual board members are not "final agency determinations" and are therefore not subject to disclosure under the Freedom of Information Law (FOIL). In contrast, any summative rating or comments approved by the entire board would constitute a final agency determination and are subject to disclosure under FOIL.

Copyright 2015 by the New York State School Boards Association

PART III: SUPERINTENDENT EVALUATION FINAL PERFORMANCE SUMMARY SHEET

Board of Education Summary Comments:

Board of Education Recommendations:

Superintendent Response:

Superintendent's Signature: _____ Date: _____

Board President's Signature: _____ Date: _____

Note: Signing this evaluation indicates that the evaluation has been reviewed and results discussed with the superintendent, but does not necessarily indicate he or she agrees on all ratings or comments made. The signed Superintendent Evaluation Final Performance Summary Sheet should be placed in the superintendent's personnel file.

Copyright 2015 by the New York State School Boards Association